



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

120 S 10th Street

October 21, 2020

Application: Alteration-Violation/Painted Brick

District: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Council District: 06

Base Zoning: R8

Map and Parcel Number: 08309020400

Applicant: David Langgle-Martin, Park Center Nashville

Project Lead: Paul Hoffman Paul.Hoffman@nashville.gov

Description of Project: The applicant painted the structures white without a permit from the Metro Historic Zoning Commission. The applicant seeks to retain the paint color.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval for the following reasons:

- The only historic building on South 10th Street and within the Edgefield Historic District is painted white;
- The property is non-contributing and located on a street with only one historic building;
- The building is oriented towards South 10th Street and the opposite side of this street is located in a neighborhood conservation zoning overlay, where paint color is not reviewed.

For these reasons, staff finds the project meets the design guidelines for Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

The screenshot shows a web-based GIS application interface. On the left, there is a legend panel with the following sections:

- Legend** (indicated by a red star icon)
- Zoning** (indicated by a dropdown arrow)
- Historic Bed and Breakfast Overlay** (indicated by a red star icon)
- Historic Landmark Overlay** (indicated by a red star icon)
- Historic Preservation Overlay** (indicated by a red star icon)

The map area displays a residential neighborhood with various lots and streets. A red-shaded area is highlighted, likely representing a historic landmark or preservation overlay. The map includes street names such as Russell and various lot numbers. A scale bar at the bottom indicates a distance of 0 to 100 feet. The map also shows various zoning designations like RM20, R8, and SP. A legend on the right side of the map area lists various lot numbers and street names.

Applicable Design Guidelines:

II.B Alterations & Repairs

II.B.5 Materials

- a. Original building materials should be retained.
- b. Where replacement is necessary, new materials should match the design, dimension, detail, and all other visual characteristics of the originals, based on physical or historical documentation.

Original building materials may include, but are not limited to, wood, brick, stone, terra cotta, stucco, cast stone and concrete.

- c. Masonry

- 1) Mortar for re-pointing should match original color, joint width, depth, and tooling profile.

When repointing brick, new mortar with a high concentration of portland cement should be avoided. Temperature and moisture cause brick and mortar to expand and contract. During expansion, the two materials press against each other, and over time, the softer of the two deteriorates. Typical "redi-mix" type mortar, which contains a high concentration of portland cement, is harder than historic brick. In such circumstances, its use can damage brick. Mortar for repointing should have a low concentration of portland cement.

- 2) Cleaning of masonry should be done with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting causes severe damage to brick, stone, and mortar, and is not appropriate.

- 3) Generally, the use of paint, stain, water repellent, or any other type of coating on brick is not appropriate.

If brick is mismatched due to insensitive repairs, paint or stain on mismatched areas may be appropriate. If brick is so deteriorated that it cannot withstand the weather, a water repellent or paint may be appropriate. In such circumstances, the paint or stain must approximate the natural material color of the original brick. Previously painted brick may be repainted using a color which approximates the natural material color of the original brick.

- 4) Previously unpainted stone should not be painted. Waterproof coatings shall not be used.

If stone is so deteriorated that it can no longer withstand the weather, a water repellent or consolidant may be appropriate. Previously painted stone may be repainted using a color which approximates the natural color of the stone.

III. B. NEW CONSTRUCTION AND ADDITIONS TO HISTORIC AND NON-HISTORIC BUILDINGS

g. Materials, Texture, Details, and Material Color

The materials, texture, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Vinyl and aluminum siding are not appropriate.

Background: 120 South 10th Street is a non-contributing building located on the edge of the Edgefield historic district.



Figure 1. Current review of 120 South 10th Street



Figure 2. 120 South 10th Street, prior to being painted.

Analysis and Findings: The applicant painted the complex white without a permit from the Metro Historic Zoning Commission (Figure 1). The applicant seeks to retain the paint color.

The design guidelines state that “Generally, the use of paint, stain, water repellent, or any other type of coating on brick is not appropriate.” For new construction and non-contributing buildings, the guidelines state that materials should be visually compatible with historic materials. The Commission, to date, has always required that paint for an existing building, historic or not, be a historic red brick color and that new brick for new construction also be a historic red brick color.

Staff finds that the white paint does not meet the design guidelines, in terms of the immediate historic vicinity but might be appropriate in this particular location because the paint color minimally impacts the historic character of the district and is similar to the only historic building on the street. The historic building is not in the immediate vicinity but rather located approximately a quarter mile south of the subject property. The historic building is not brick; however, a stucco veneer is often considered a “masonry” treatment. Historic brick buildings in the immediate vicinity are red but are not oriented to South 10th Street. 120 South 10th Street is a non-contributing building, oriented to South 10th Street and located at the edge of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. The opposite side of South 10th is located in a neighborhood conservation zoning overlay, where paint color is not reviewed.



Figure 3. Across the street is the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay where paint color is not reviewed.

If approved for the reasons noted previously, this could set a precedent for paint color of existing non-historic masonry buildings oriented towards South 10th and located within the Edgefield district, specifically the following. Staff does not find that this would create a precedent for any other non-contributing buildings within the district or for brick color review for any proposed new construction on South 10th Street or elsewhere in the district.



Figure 4. 200 B South 10th Street is a non-contributing complex.



Figure 5. 210 South 10th Street, East Nashville Free Will Baptist Church is a non-contributing building.



Figure 6. 300 South 10th Street is a non-contributing building.



Figure 7. 929 Boscobel St has a non-contributing building, oriented to South 10th Street. There are two more non-historic buildings on this parcel oriented towards Boscobel Street that would still need to have paint reviewed.



Figure 8. 934 Boscobel St is a non-contributing building, oriented to South 10th Street.



Figure 9. 410 South 10th Street is the only historic building oriented towards South 10th Street and located within the Edgefield Historic District. It was likely historically white.



Figure 10. 918 Shelby Street is a rear building on an otherwise vacant lot. New construction located at 918 Shelby should be an appropriate historic red brick color, if it is a masonry building.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval for the following reasons:

- The only historic building on South 10th Street and within the Edgefield Historic District is painted white;
- The property is non-contributing and located on a street with only one historic building; and,
- The building is oriented towards South 10th Street and the opposite side of this street is located in a neighborhood conservation zoning overlay, where paint color is not reviewed.

For these reasons, staff finds the project meets the design guidelines for Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.